



**Elana Stein Hain with Christine Hayes**

**Loss and Uncertainty  
December 2023**

- |    |                            |   |
|----|----------------------------|---|
| 1. | Talmud Bavli Hagigah 4b    | 1 |
| 2. | Talmud Bavli Hagigah 5a-5b | 2 |

**Dr. Elana Stein Hain** is the Rosh Beit Midrash and a Senior Fellow at the Shalom Hartman Institute of North America, where she serves as lead faculty, engages in research and curriculum development and consults on the content of lay and professional leadership programs.

**Dr. Christine Hayes** is a Senior Fellow of the Kogod Research Center at the Shalom Hartman Institute of North America. She is the Sterling Professor Emeritus of Religious Studies at Yale University, specializing in talmudic-midrashic studies.

**The Shalom Hartman Institute** is a leading center of Jewish thought and education, serving Israel and North America. Our mission is to strengthen Jewish peoplehood, identity, and pluralism; to enhance the Jewish and democratic character of Israel; and to ensure that Judaism is a compelling force for good in the 21st century.

Shalom Hartman Institute of North America

475 Riverside Drive, Suite 1450

New York, NY 10115

212-268-0300

[info@shalomhartman.org](mailto:info@shalomhartman.org) | [www.shalomhartman.org](http://www.shalomhartman.org)

## 1. Talmud Bavli Hagigah 4b

רב הונא כי מטי להאי קרא "יראה" "יראה, בְּכִי. אָמַר: עֶבֶד שָׁרְבוּ מִצֶּפֶה לוֹ לְרֵאוֹתוֹ  
וְתִרְחַק מִמֶּנּוּ, דְּכִתִּיב: "כִּי תָבוֹאוּ לְרֵאוֹת פָּנֶי מִי בִקֵּשׁ זֹאת מִיָּדְכֶם רְמוֹס חֲצָרִי".

When Rav Huna reached the verse (about Jews coming on pilgrimage to Jerusalem three times a year - Exodus 23:17 - which says) "will appear (*yera'eh*)" but can also be vocalized as "He will see (*yir'eh*)" he cried. (*Yera'eh*, "will appear," refers to the obligation of Israelites to appear before God, but the *Yir'eh*, "He will see," focuses on God seeing those who come to Jerusalem.) He said: A servant whose master anticipates seeing him, the master will distance himself from him? As it is written: "When you come to appear before Me, who asked this of you, to trample My courts!" (Isaiah 1:12).

רב הונא כי מטי להאי קרא, בְּכִי: "וְזָבַחְתָּ שְׁלָמִים וְאָכַלְתָּ שֶׁם", עֶבֶד שָׁרְבוּ מִצֶּפֶה לֵאכֹל  
עַל שְׁלִחָנוּ וְתִרְחַק מִמֶּנּוּ? דְּכִתִּיב: "לָמָּה לִּי רוֹב זִבְחֵיכֶם יֹאמַר ה'..."

When Rav Huna reached this verse, he cried: "And you shall sacrifice peace-offerings, and you shall eat there" (Deuteronomy 27:7) [about crossing the Jordan River and doing a ceremony, offering sacrifices on Mt. Eval]. A servant whose master anticipates eating at his table, the master will distance himself from him? As it is written: "To what purpose is the multitude of your offerings to Me? says the Lord" (Isaiah 1:11)...

רַבִּי אָמִי כִּי מָטִי לְהָאִי קָרָא, בְּכִי: "יִתֵּן בְּעַפְרֵי פִיהוּ אוֹלִי יֵשׁ תִּקְוָה", אָמַר: כּוֹלִי הָאִי  
וְ"אוֹלִי"?! רַבִּי אָמִי כִּי מָטִי לְהָאִי קָרָא, בְּכִי: "בִּקְשׁוּ צֶדֶק בִּקְשׁוּ עֲנִנָה אוֹלִי תִסְתָּרוּ בְּיוֹם  
אַף ה'", אָמַר: כּוֹלִי הָאִי וְ"אוֹלִי"?! רַבִּי אָסִי כִּי מָטִי לְהָאִי קָרָא, בְּכִי: "שִׁנְאוּ רָע וְאַהֲבוּ  
טוֹב וְהִצִּיגוּ בְשַׁעַר מִשְׁפַּט אוֹלִי יִחַנֵּן ה' [אֶל-לֵהִי] צָב-אוֹת", כּוֹלִי הָאִי וְ"אוֹלִי"?!...

When Rabbi Ami reached this verse, he cried: "Let him put his mouth in the dust, perhaps there may be hope" (Lamentations 3:29). He said: All this and only "perhaps"! When Rabbi Ami reached this verse, he cried: "Seek righteousness, seek humility; perhaps you will find shelter on the day of the Lord's anger" (Zephaniah 2:3). He said: All this, and only "perhaps"?! Likewise, when Rabbi Asi reached this verse, he cried: "Hate the evil, and love good, and establish justice in the gate; perhaps the Lord, the God of hosts, will be gracious (to the remnant of Joseph)" (Amos 5:15). All of this, and only "perhaps"!?

## 2. Talmud Bavli Hagigah 5a-5b

”וְחָרָה אַפִּי בּוֹ בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא וְעִזְבֹתֵיהֶם וְהִסְתַּתְתִּי פָנַי מֵהֶם,” אָמַר רַב בְּרִדְלָא בַר טַבְיּוּמִי אָמַר  
רַב: כָּל שֶׁאֵינוֹ בְּהִסְתַּתֵּר פָּנָיו — אֵינוֹ מֵהֶם, כָּל שֶׁאֵינוֹ בְּ”וְחָרָה לְאַכּוֹל” אֵינוֹ מֵהֶם...

“Then My anger shall be kindled against them in that day, and I will forsake them, and I will hide My face from them [and they shall be devoured]” (Deuteronomy 31:17). Rav Bardela bar Tavyomei said that Rav said: Anyone who is not subject to God’s hiding of the face is not from the Jewish people; anyone who is not subject to: “And they shall be devoured” is not from the Jewish people...

”וְאִם לֹא תִשְׁמָעוּהָ בְּמִסְתָּרִים תִּבְכֶּה נַפְשִׁי מִפְּנֵי גְדוּלָּתָהּ,” אָמַר רַב שְׁמוּאֵל בַּר יִנְיָא מְשַׁמִּיָּה  
דְּרַב: מָקוֹם יֵשׁ לוֹ לְהִקְדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא וּמִסְתָּרִים שְׁמוֹ:

The verse states: “But if you will not hear it, my soul shall weep in secret (*be-mistarim*) for your pride” (Jeremiah 13:17). Rav Shmuel bar Inya said in the name of Rav: The Holy blessed One has a place to go and cry, and its name is *Mistarim* (lit., hidden places).